

Justice and Profit in Health Care Law

*A Comparative Analysis of the United States
and the United Kingdom*

Sabrina Germain

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

1151036

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2019

Copyright © Sabrina Germain, 2019

Sabrina Germain has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union,
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2019.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Germain, Sabrina, author.

Title: Justice and profit in health care law : a comparative analysis of the United States and the United Kingdom / Sabrina Germain.

Description: Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford : Hart Publishing, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018049648 (print) | LCCN 2018055846 (ebook) | ISBN 9781509902729 (Epub) | ISBN 9781509902705 (hardback) | ISBN 9781509902712 (ePDF)

Subjects: LCSH: Medical policy—United States. | Medical economics—United States. | Medical policy—United Kingdom. | Medical economics—United Kingdom. | BISAC: LAW / Health. | LAW / Comparative. | LAW / Medical Law & Legislation.

Classification: LCC RA395.A3 (ebook) | LCC RA395.A3 G392 2019 (print) | DDC 338.4/73621—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018049648>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50990-270-5
ePDF: 978-1-50990-271-2
ePub: 978-1-50990-272-9

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xix
1. Introduction.....	1
I. Justice, Profit and the Law	3
A. Profit and Health Care	4
B. Discourses of Justice.....	6
C. Legislative Intent.....	8
D. History and Health Care Reforms.....	9
II. Essential Elements of the Book.....	11
A. Methodological Considerations	12
B. Outline of the Book.....	13
2. Understanding Health Care as a Question of Justice	15
I. Introduction	15
II. Justice and the Allocation of Health Care Resources.....	16
III. Moral Political Philosophy and Universality of Care.....	18
A. Claims in Support of Universality of Care	18
B. Alternative Claims in Support of Universality of Care.....	24
C. Claims Against Universality of Care	29
IV. Organising Principles for Health Care Systems.....	33
A. The Principle of Solidarity.....	33
B. The Principle of Subsidiarity.....	35
V. Theories of a Right to Health and a Right to Health Care.....	36
A. The Egalitarian Perspective on a Right to Health Care	37
B. The Utilitarian Perspective on a Right to Health Care	38
C. The Communitarian Perspective on a Right to Health Care.....	39
D. The Libertarian Perspective on a Right to Health Care.....	40
E. Health as an Absolute Right.....	40
VI. Conclusion.....	43
3. For-Profit Stakeholders in American Health Care Policy.....	45
I. Introduction	45

xii *Contents*

II.	The Overlapping History of American For-Profit Actors.....	47
A.	Medical Professionals.....	47
B.	Employers.....	52
C.	Insurers.....	55
III.	Contemporary Dynamics in Health Care Policy.....	60
A.	The Issues: Costs and Other Barriers to Access Health Care.....	61
B.	The Failed Solutions: Management and Cost-Containment.....	64
IV.	Conclusion.....	68
4.	Locating Ideas of Justice in American Health Care Reforms.....	70
I.	Introduction.....	70
II.	The Kerr–Mills Act (1960).....	73
A.	The Means Test and the New Welfare Category.....	73
B.	Ideas of Liberal Equality.....	75
III.	Medicare and Medicaid (1965).....	78
A.	Propositions from Insurers, Employers and the Medical Profession.....	81
B.	Ideas of Welfare Equality.....	84
IV.	The Health Maintenance Organization and Resources Development Act (1973).....	87
A.	A Cost Management Solution Supported by Insurers and Employers.....	88
B.	Ideas of Libertarian and Communitarian Justice.....	92
V.	The Affordable Care Act (2010).....	94
A.	Negotiating Universality Health Care with the For-Profit Sector.....	96
B.	Libertarian Ideas of Justice Versus Ideas of Liberal Equality.....	98
C.	An Unprecedented Judicial Battle.....	100
VI.	Conclusion.....	103
5.	For-Profit Stakeholders in British Health Care Policy.....	105
I.	Introduction.....	105
II.	The Medical Profession: A Defensive and Dissident Force.....	107
A.	Establishing the Terms of the Concordat (1950s–70s).....	107
B.	Redefining the Roles (1980s–90s).....	113
C.	Adapting to the Dynamics of Consumerism in Health Care (2000s–the Present).....	118
III.	Private Initiatives in Health Care.....	125
A.	Private Finance Initiatives: PFI and LIFT.....	126
B.	Private Medical Insurance.....	132
C.	The Independent Sector Responding to Consumerism in Health Care.....	134
IV.	Conclusion.....	138

6. Locating Ideas of Justice in British Health Care Reforms	140
I. Introduction	140
II. The National Health Service Act (1946)	142
A. The Beveridge Report.....	144
B. The Foundations of the First Universal Health Care System.....	146
C. Ideas of Liberal Equality	149
III. The National Health Service and Community Care Act (1990).....	151
A. Working for Patients	154
B. Ideas of Utilitarian Justice	158
IV. The Health and Social Care Act (2012).....	162
A. Two White Papers, One Reform.....	164
B. Ideas of Libertarian Justice and Neoliberalism.....	167
V. Conclusion.....	171
7. Conclusion.....	173
<i>Appendix</i>	180
<i>Bibliography</i>	181
<i>Index</i>	195